

Boulevard Planning Group
MINUTES/SUMMARY, JANUARY 6, 2011
Boulevard Fire and Rescue Inc. Training Room, 39919 Highway 94/Ribbonwood

1) CALL TO ORDER at 7:12 PM.

2) DETERMINATION OF QUORUM/ROLL CALL: Members present: Tammy Daubach, Cheryl Lenz, Jeffrey McKernan, Chris Noland, Patricia Stuart, Donna Tisdale (Chair). Excused Absence: Audra Hall

3) APPROVAL OF MINUTES: M/S McKernan/Stuart to approve the December 2, 2010 minutes. Passed: 5-0-1. (Lenz abstained due to absence at the December meeting.)

4) CORRESPONDENCE: No correspondence other than agenda items.

5) NEW BUSINESS:

A. ANNUAL ELECTION OF OFFICERS:

M/S Lenz/Stuart to elect Donna Tisdale as Chair of the Boulevard Planning Group. Passed: 6-0-0.

M/S Tisdale/Lenz to elect Chris Nolan as Vice Chair of the Boulevard Planning Group. Passed: 6-0-0.

M/S Stuart/Lenz to elect Audra Hall as Secretary of the Boulevard Planning Group. Passed: 6-0-0.

B. JAN 19TH COMMUNITY MEETING ON ADVERSE HEALTH AND PROPERTY VALUE IMPACTS FROM WIND ENERGY PROJECTS: At the request of the planning group and others, a community meeting on the adverse health and property value impacts from wind energy projects will be held in the Boulevard Fire Departments equipment bay on January 19th from 7:00 PM – 9:00 PM. There will be two main speakers addressing adverse health effects from low frequency noise, infrasonic vibrations and shadow flicker, and impacts on property values. The Chair reported there is a wide interest from other groups and communities. Potential meeting sponsors, joining the Boulevard Planning Group, are BAD, POC, ECCAC and REAL. It was announced that volunteers were needed to help with this meeting.

C. OUTREACH TO TRIBAL LEADERS ON WIND ENERGY PROJECT IMPACTS: It was agreed that direct outreach and communication, with personal invitations to the meeting, was critical.

M/S McKernan/Stuart that the Planning Group send a letter to the local tribal leaders inviting them to attend the January 19th Community Meeting with outline of general concerns. Passed 6-0-0.

D. PUC/BLM DEIR/EIS FOR TULE WIND, ECO SUBSTATION, ENERGIA SIERRA JUAREZ, COMMENTS DUE FEB 16, 2011: Informational workshops will be held at the Jacumba Highland Center on January 26, 2011 at 7:00 PM and at the Boulevard Volunteer Fire Dept. on February 2, 2011 at 7:00 PM. The Chair encouraged everyone to submit written comments and participate in the public meetings. Project concerns should be forwarded to the Chair who will draft the Planning Group's comment letter. The draft letter will be reviewed and acted on at the regular meeting set for February 3rd.

Large maps were displayed of the proposed project, the preferred alternative, and the cumulative projects, along with other project maps. The Chair reported that she had failed to notify the applicants of this agenda item. However, the Group had previously voted to formally oppose the project. It was also reported that the Environmentally Superior Alternative under CEQA is the NO Project, based on Significant Class 1 impacts

to Air Quality, Noise (from construction--*not* from turbines), Biological Resources, Visual Character, Fire and Fuels Management (from power lines *not* from turbines), and Cultural Resources. When the NO Project Alternative ranks number 1, CEQA requires a second Alternative. That alternative is the same as the BLM preferred Alternative that reduces the number of turbines by 62, from 134 to 72, removing 17 from Ewiiapayyp tribal lands, 27 from BLM land, 7 from State Lands Commission land, and 11 from Hamann Companies Rough Acres Ranch. The agency preferred alternative also proposes partial undergrounding of new 138 kV transmission lines from Rough Acres Ranch to the new Boulevard Substation and for part of the stretch south of the Boulevard Substation through the Jewel Valley area. The O&M building would be moved to a different location on Rough Acres Ranch, northwest of existing buildings, and the ECO Substation would be moved several hundred feet to the east. Impacts from the preferred alternative also result in significant Class 1 impacts. Other alternatives were retained and carried forward. Any mix and match combination of alternatives could end up at the approved project and no Supplemental EIR/REIS will be required.

The significant height of the proposed turbines, at up to 500 feet, was a major issue of concern. As an example, Planner Noland stated that the highly visible flag pole at De La Fuente Cadillac in El Cajon is 160 feet tall and the existing Kumeyaay Wind turbines are about 325 feet tall.

Questions were raised by a local resident / tribal member, Dave Elliott, regarding the proposed gen-tie routes for tribal wind projects and the potential to connect to the existing SDG&E line and Substation at the Golden Acorn Casino instead of going across private land to the Boulevard Substation. SDG&E's Cameron Durckel stated that there are about 6 projects in line to connect to the proposed Boulevard Substation and about 4 at proposed ECO Substation. SDG&E's wind project on the Manzanita Reservation is expected to go online around 2014-15 and their joint wind project with Invenergy on the Campo Reservation is expected to go online around 2013-14.

Cumulative impacts to cultural resources from multiple large-scale projects on federal land were also raised along with efforts to repatriate human remains and the harder process to return artifacts to local tribes. SDG&E has reportedly resisted some suggested project changes to protect those resources. Artifacts are often collected and removed from the site without being returned to closest tribe. This is a shared concern.

Elliott also raised groundwater contamination concerns along with the need to request / require catch basins at the base of each wind turbine to catch and contain oil / fluid leaks before they can percolate into the water. He has seen evidence of those leaks, and noted that oil can also become airborne during windy weather.

Concerns were also raised regarding the increased threat of fire from malfunctioning and flaming turbines, and new power lines. Local property owner, Chris Dunn, stated their insurance carrier dropped their coverage after the 2003 fire storms and they had to go to Lloyds of London for coverage. Their rate increased from \$650 per year to \$2,000. It was reduced some in the last few years when the volunteer fire department improved staffing. He was concerned that rates will go higher or be cancelled again when these turbine and power line projects are built in local residential areas creating hazards.

The Chair discussed previous scoping letter comments and called for additional input. Planner Noland requested inclusion of the information from the recent Administrative Permit Applications for the Enel Jewel Valley and Brucci MET facility proposals. That information includes documentation on negative impacts to property values from industrial wind turbines and the "constructive notice" or pending wind turbine projects that MET facilities represent, along with adverse health effects from low frequency noise and infrasonic vibrations generated by large turbines.

M/S Lenz/Stuart that the Planning Group send a letter requesting that the public workshops be changed to real public hearings with court reporter. Passed 6-0-0.

Amended Motion:

M/S Lenz/Stuart that the Planning Group send a letter requesting that the public workshops be changed to public hearings, with a court reporter, and a request the comment deadline be extended by 30 days. Passed 6-0-0.

Page 2 of 4

Boulevard Planning Group Minutes for JANUARY 6, 2011

E. TULE WIND MUP CASE # 3300-09-019 (PO9-019): The Planning Group discussed the fact that the Draft EIR/EIS for Tule Wind, ECO Substation and Energia Sierra Juarez will be used as the basis for the County's MUP if it is deemed compliant with CEQA, with separate hearings. No action was taken.

F. VERIZON MUP MODIFICATION WHITE STAR FACILITY: P90-019W4: The County requested a yes or no vote on this item in addition to previous vote requesting testing for workplace safety at the adjacent Cal Fire White Star Fire Station. The County cannot require applicants to conduct environmental testing as requested by fire fighters and the Planning Group.

M/S Noland/McKernan that the Planning Group reject Verizon's modification based on lack of testing requested. Passed 6-0-0.

G. REQUEST TO COUNTY TO PROVIDE PLANNING AREA MAP SHOWING APN NUMBERS AND PROPERTY OWNERS: The County responded to request with incomplete mapping--based on size.

M/S Lenz/Stuart that the Planning Group request a map of the Boulevard planning area showing APN numbers and property owners to be broken down in North/South/East/West sections from the County at no cost. Passed 6-0-0.

6.UPDATES AND POTENTIAL ACTION ITEMS:

A. ACTION MAY BE TAKEN ON THE BRUCCI MET TOWER APPEAL OR THE ENEL JEWEL VALLEY MET TOWER APPLICATIONS IF HEARINGS FOR THOSE PROJECTS ARE SET PRIOR TO OUR FEBRUARY MEETING: No hearings were set or noticed. No action taken.

B. GENERAL PLAN UPDATE: The list of Property Specific Requests, submitted by individual property owners in the Boulevard Planning Area, including John Gibson & Hamann Companies, Gregory Lansing and Frankie Thibodeou, were discussed. The Board of Supervisors will review the requests on Feb 9th. The requests were similar to those previously rejected. There was no support to reopen the process which could lead to another 13-year process for the GP Update.

M/S Noland/Stuart that the Planning Group reject any and all Property Specific Requests for changes to the Boulevard Planning Area Draft Land Use Map /Recommended Project. Passed 6-0-0.

C. SUNRISE POWERLINK & BOULEVARD COMMUNITY COUNCIL: SDG&E representatives, Cameron Durckel and Don Parent, attended the meeting to answer questions and provide community updates on the Sunrise Powerlink. In response to previous questions, Durckel reported that 10 oaks would be trimmed but not removed. He would need to check and respond later regarding impacts along Cameron Truck Trail where many trees are marked. The Project Modification Report says 8 acres of Woodlands & Forest will be impacted. 72 % of that is at the Suncrest Substation site. Dave Elliot stated that a Native American, working there, was upset that a massive oak in the Suncrest Substation area, that SDG&E had promised would only be topped, was later bulldozed down and destroyed. Durckel stated that there were 255 acres of permanent impact and 488 acres of temporary impacts. 9,000 acres of mitigation land has been purchased in Lakeside and Santa Ynez. He agreed that 6,000 acres of that was purchased out of the area for impacts to the local endangered bighorn sheep. The Chair challenged the Tule Wind EIR/EIS that says McCain Valley is not suitable habitat for bighorn sheep. Elliott stated that when he was young, and before BLM opened up McCain Valley, bighorn sheep used to use graze in McCain Valley, at Black Mountain on a regular basis. Some are still seen in the area. He believed they were all the way up into the Lagunas and that Black Mountain was a known bat area. He also reported that an injured bighorn ram recently showed up in rural Alpine where it was provided feed until he left on his own. Lorrie Ostrander stated she had seen two bighorns immediately north of I-8 near the Kitchen Creek exit. She also questioned SDG&E on the

building they leased in Jacumba, forcing the closure of a new astrology store, by offering the owner \$400 per month more, before they decided not to use the building because it was too remote / or not ADA compliant. It is still sitting empty, but SDG&E continues to pay the lease. SDG&E may use the building during construction of the ECO Substation. Durckel promised to research and report on the number of acres of mitigation that may be taking place in Boulevard and Jacumba. None of the locals were aware of any.

D. BOULEVARD REVITALIZATION: The Chair reported that Planner Lenz had officially stepped down from the revitalization committee and had generously donated a new multi-media projector for the planning group and community. She stated her gift was conditioned on the Chair maintaining custody of the projector. Planner Daubach reported that the December 3rd meeting was not as well attended as usual. Tisdale raised concerns and offered information on the adverse health effects from wind turbines. Chief Francois complained about lack of County response / follow up on fire station repairs / upgrades. Supervisor Dianne Jacob said that she would be looking into the property for the new fire department.

7. PRESENTATION FROM THE FLOOR ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS: Planner Daubach announced that the next Boulevard/Jacumba/LaPosta Fire Safe Council meeting will take place on January 24th at 6:30 PM in the Boulevard Fire Dept. Training Room.

8) ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 9:46 pm. Minutes are submitted by Tammy Daubach, Secretary.

For more information, contact
Donna Tisdale, Chair, 619-766-4170
donnatisdale@hughes.net
P. O. Box 1272, Boulevard, CA 91905